

Evaluation of the Relevance and Effectiveness of the C Level Equivalency Education for Productive Age Learners

Liza Tri Easti Putri¹, Sudarwan Danim¹, Muhammad Kristiawan¹

¹Universitas Bengkulu, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Corresponding author e-mail: lizat4303@gmail.com

Article History: Received on 19 September 2025, Revised on 3 October 2025,
Published on 2 February 2026

Abstract: In Indonesia, a significant portion of the productive-age population lacks formal secondary education credentials, limiting their employment and further education opportunities. This study employed a qualitative goal-oriented evaluation (Tyler, 1949) to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the C Level Equivalency Program at PKBM Putri Raflesia, using interviews, observations, and document analysis. Findings indicate that the program's objectives are highly relevant to learners' needs for diplomas and skills. The flexible, andragogical approach was effective in improving comprehension and participation, leading to significant impacts on graduates' self-confidence, employment, and educational mobility. The study concludes that the C Level program is a vital mechanism for socio-economic empowerment, demonstrating that program success hinges more on pedagogical strategies and relevance than on material resources. This research contributes by highlighting the role of community-based non-formal education in addressing educational inequality, providing practical insights for policymakers to strengthen adult learning programs, and offering novelty in applying Tyler's model to evaluate non-formal education for productive-age learners in Indonesia.

Keywords: C Level Equivalency Program, Goal-Oriented Evaluation, Non-Formal Education, PKBM Putri Raflesia, Productive-Age Learners

A. Introduction

This study examines the relevance and effectiveness of the C Level Equivalency Program for productive-age learners at PKBM Putri Raflesia, South Bengkulu. The program represents a form of non-formal education designed as an alternative for community members who are unable to complete formal education. Non-formal education programs are recognized for their flexibility, accessibility, and capacity to serve learners outside the formal system (Arbarini et al., 2025). The purpose of this research is to evaluate how well the C Level Equivalency Program addresses the educational needs of productive-age learners by applying Tyler's Goal-Oriented Evaluation Model. Previous studies employing goal-oriented evaluation in Indonesia show that it is effective in assessing program achievement and clarifying objectives (Harahap & Asmawi, 2008).

In the context of Indonesia's legal framework, non-formal education is legislated under Law No. 20 of 2003 as having the role to supplement, complement, and/or substitute formal education, and equivalency assessments allow for formal recognition of non-formal education outcomes. While there is literature on non-formal education and its contributions to human resource development (Melania et al., 2024), there remains a gap in evaluating equality-level programs (equivalency) for productive-age groups in specific local contexts like South Bengkulu.

Productive-age learners (often defined as individuals aged approximately 15–64) are strategically important in national human capital development. Many within this age group in Indonesia have not completed upper secondary education due to economic, social, or geographic constraints. Non-formal education provides a route to mitigate these barriers, by improving job opportunities, educational mobility, and civic participation. Despite the recognized importance, few empirical studies have focused specifically on the effectiveness of equivalency programs for productive-age learners using rigorous evaluation models. Another reason for focusing on productive-age learners is that this group has different learning needs compared to school-age learners. They require not only academic knowledge but also practical skills relevant to the labor market. Therefore, it is important to evaluate whether the learning objectives of the C Level Equivalency Program align with the characteristics and needs of productive-age participants. This is supported by evidence that effective adult learning systems are designed to be flexible, contextual, and aligned with working-life skills, especially given the rapidly changing labor market demands (Ines, 2016).

The evaluation model used in this study is the Goal-Oriented Model developed by Ralph Tyler. Although older, this model's core premise—that learning objectives established in advance should be aligned with and measured against actual learning outcomes is still relevant and discussed in recent literature on curriculum design and outcomes alignment (Alfauzan & Tarchouna, 2017). Thus, this approach is well-suited to assess the effectiveness of programs implemented by PKBM in meeting the needs and goals of productive-age participants.

The novelty of this study lies in its focus on evaluating the C Level Equivalency Program from the perspective of productive age learners, using Tyler's goal-oriented evaluation model specifically within PKBM Putri Raflesia South Bengkulu. Previous studies have largely emphasized general program implementation or school-age participants. This research introduces an evaluative dimension that is goal-oriented and contextually relevant to the working-age group in developing urban settings. This study contributes to the development of non-formal education programs in Indonesia, particularly in designing and evaluating programs that are more relevant and effective for productive age learners. Furthermore, the findings are expected to provide practical recommendations for PKBM managers, the Department of Education, and other stakeholders in formulating equivalency education policies

based on the actual needs of society.

B. Methods

This research employed a qualitative descriptive approach within a single-case study design, focusing on the C Level Equivalency Program at PKBM Putri Raflesia, South Bengkulu. The qualitative descriptive tradition is widely considered suitable for generating straightforward, rich accounts of participants' experiences while remaining close to their own language and perspectives. Recent methodological discussions highlight that this approach is especially useful when the aim is to provide practical insights for policy and practice rather than to build abstract theory (Hall & Liebenberg, 2024; Neergaard et al., 2009). The use of a single-case design, as described by Yin (2018), allowed this study to investigate a bounded case in depth and to capture the organizational and socio-cultural specificities of a single PKBM.

Participants were chosen through purposive sampling to ensure that data would be drawn from individuals most directly involved in and knowledgeable about the program. The sample consisted of fifteen informants: the program administrator, four tutors, eight active learners, and two alumni. This strategy was applied because purposive sampling is recognized as an effective way to access information-rich cases that can shed light on key research questions (Palinkas et al., 2015). Variation in participant background such as age, gender, employment status, and duration of participation was also considered to capture multiple perspectives on program relevance, learning processes, and outcomes.

Data collection relied primarily on semi-structured interviews, which were conducted with all participants. The interviews lasted approximately 40–60 minutes each and followed a guide developed through a systematic framework to ensure both structure and flexibility (Kallio et al., 2016). The core themes addressed during the interviews included participants' perceptions of program objectives, experiences of learning interactions, perceived academic and non-academic outcomes, as well as barriers and recommendations for improvement. While the guide ensured comparability across interviews, follow-up questions allowed participants to elaborate on personal experiences, thus generating richer data. In addition to interviews, direct observations were conducted during six learning sessions, each lasting around ninety minutes. These observations focused on aspects such as instructional practices, learner engagement, tutor-learner relationships, and the availability and use of learning resources. Notes were taken systematically during sessions and expanded into detailed memos after each observation to ensure accuracy and depth (Mulhall, 2003).

A further source of evidence came from document analysis, which aimed to complement and triangulate the interview and observational data. The documents examined included the PKBM's vision and mission statements, the official C Level

curriculum and syllabi, lesson plans for observed sessions, attendance sheets, learner assessments and grade records, alumni written testimonials, and the formal certificates issued to graduates. Systematic document analysis can strengthen qualitative findings by providing stable data that reflect institutional perspectives and practices (Bowen, 2009).

Data analysis followed an iterative, multi-step process inspired by widely accepted qualitative frameworks. All interview recordings were transcribed verbatim, and transcripts, field notes, and documents were initially coded inductively to capture key phrases and emerging ideas from participants' own words. These open codes were then grouped into more focused categories aligned with the study's objectives—such as program goals, pedagogical practices, learning experiences, and perceived outcomes. The use of coding and categorization in this manner is a well-established strategy for qualitative descriptive analysis (Colorafi & Evans, 2016)

Once initial coding was completed, data were organized into thematic matrices and tables to facilitate comparison across participants and sources. These displays helped to identify convergences and divergences in perceptions and experiences, and also allowed for systematic alignment between program documents and participants' accounts (Lorelli S Nowell et al., 2017). The process of drawing conclusions involved looking for recurring patterns, contradictions, and explanations, while continuously revisiting the raw data to ensure interpretations remained grounded.

To ensure trustworthiness, several strategies were applied. Member checking was conducted by sharing summaries of findings with a subset of participants to confirm accuracy and provide opportunities for clarification. Triangulation was achieved by cross-validating data from interviews, observations, and documents. An audit trail of coding decisions and analytic memos was maintained to ensure transparency and dependability. These procedures are widely recognized as strengthening credibility, dependability, and confirmability in qualitative research (L. S. Nowell et al., 2017; (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Transferability was addressed by providing detailed contextual descriptions of the PKBM and its participants, enabling readers to assess the relevance of findings to other contexts. Ethical approval was obtained from the relevant institutional board, informed consent was collected from all participants, and identifying information was carefully anonymized.

In summary, this methodological approach combining semi-structured interviews, structured observations, and document analysis, analyzed through systematic coding, thematic organization, and triangulation was designed to provide a comprehensive and trustworthy account of the relevance and effectiveness of the C Level Equivalency Program for productive age learners in South Bengkulu.

C. Results and Discussion

Results

The findings of this study are organized into four themes: relevance, learning experience, effectiveness, and impact.

Relevance of C Level Equivalency Program Objectives

Based on data found at the Putri Raflesia Community Learning Center (PKBM), the relevance of C level equivalency program's objectives is in line with the needs of students, especially those of productive age. The following table presents interviews related to the objectives and relevance of the C Level Equivalency Program.

Table 1. Interview Results Regarding the Relevance of the C Level Equivalency Program Objectives

Focus	Data Findings
Program Objectives	The C Level Equivalency Program aims to provide access to high school-equivalent education for productive-age individuals who have not yet completed formal education. The Head of the Community Learning Center (PKBM) emphasized that this program is an effort to empower the community so they can obtain a diploma and increase opportunities for employment or further education.
Program Suitability to Participants' Needs	The program was deemed highly appropriate for the needs of participants, most of whom are workers or housewives. The afternoon and evening study schedule makes it easy for them to participate in learning without disrupting their daily activities. Tutors and participants stated that this flexibility is a key strength of the program.
Motivation for Participating in the Program	Participants participated in the program due to the need for a diploma as a job requirement, the desire to continue their studies, and the hope of improving their quality of life. Some also cited personal reasons, such as making their family proud or resolving a past educational delay.
Administrative and Social Benefits	Alumni stated that the program provided tangible administrative benefits, such as being able to apply for jobs or participate in the Civil Servant Candidate (CPNS) selection process. Furthermore, they felt more socially valued and had increased self-confidence after obtaining their diploma.

Table 2. Documentation Results: Relevance of C Level Equivalency Program Objectives

Focus	Data Findings
PKBM Vision and Mission Document	A clear statement states that one of the PKBM's objectives is to provide access to education to those who have not completed formal education, primarily targeting those of working age.
Student Profile	Based on participant data documents, the majority of participants are aged 20–35, are employed, and have dropped out of high school. This demonstrates the program's relevance to the target population.
Registration Form and Initial Interview	A column asking "reasons for participating in the program" is provided, which participants generally answer with answers such as: wanting to obtain a diploma, apply for a job, or continue their studies. This supports the finding that the program's objectives and relevance align with the participants' needs.

Data from interviews and documents indicate that the program is closely aligned with the needs of productive-age learners. As shown in Table 1, the program's primary objective is to provide access to high school-equivalent education for individuals who did not complete formal schooling. Participants emphasized that flexible schedules – particularly afternoon and evening classes – allowed them to join without disrupting work or household responsibilities. Motivations for participation included the need for a diploma for employment, the desire to pursue higher education, and personal aspirations such as making their families proud. Documentation review (Table 2) confirmed this alignment: participant profiles showed the majority were aged 20–35 and employed, and registration forms consistently cited obtaining a diploma as the main reason for enrollment. Alumni testimonies further revealed that the program facilitated administrative benefits (e.g., job applications, civil servant recruitment) and increased social recognition.

C Level Equivalency Program Learning Experience

To observe the learning process implemented in the C Level Equivalency Program at PKBM Putri Raflesia, researchers collected data through in-depth interviews with the PKBM head, tutors, and students. They also conducted direct observations of learning activities and reviewed supporting documents such as lesson schedules, syllabi, and visual documentation of activities. The following table presents the results of observations related to the learning experience in the C Level Equivalency Program at PKBM Putri Raflesia.

Table 3. Observation Results of Learning Experiences in the Package C Program

Focus	Data Findings
Learning Atmosphere and Conditions	Learning takes place in a simple but conducive classroom. The classroom is well-lit, the seating is neatly arranged, and there is adequate ventilation. Although not equipped with modern media such as an LCD projector, the tutor uses a whiteboard, printed modules, and simple teaching aids. The classroom atmosphere is relaxed, friendly, and participatory. Participants actively participate in the lesson and are willing to ask questions. The tutor is friendly, open, and facilitates small group discussions.
Learning Methods Used	The tutor uses interactive lectures, question-and-answer sessions, group discussions, and practice exercises as part of the learning process. On several occasions, the tutor relates the material to the participants' real-life experiences, such as daily work, household situations, and social experiences.

Table 4. Interview Results: Learning Experiences in Package C Program

Focus	Data Findings
Learning Method	Learning uses an andragogical approach, using discussion methods, interactive lectures, case studies, and practice exercises. The material is tailored to the participants' lives, making it easier to understand and feel contextual.
Learning Schedule and Time	Learning times are set in the afternoon and evening to accommodate participants' work schedules. This flexibility allows for broader participation from productive-age students.
Learning Conditions and Facilities	Despite limited learning resources (such as the lack of LCDs or computers), the learning process remains effective by utilizing simple aids. Tutors and participants adapt to the existing conditions.
Participant Learning Experience	Participants feel comfortable because the tutor is open and patient in explaining the material. The class atmosphere is described as relaxed yet serious.
Tutor Support	Tutors actively provide personal support to participants, especially those who are behind or rarely attend. Tutors also motivate participants to persevere and continue completing the program.

In addition to observations and interviews, these findings are also supported by documentation. The following table presents documentation results related to the learning experiences of the C Level Equivalency Program.

Table 5. Documentation Results of the C Level Equivalency Program Learning Experience

Focus	Data Findings
Learning Activity Schedule	Documents indicate that learning activities are held three times a week from 3:00 PM to 5:00 PM. This is adjusted to accommodate participants' working hours.
Tutor and Participant Attendance List	Tutor attendance is consistent, while participant attendance varies, especially leading up to exams. Documents demonstrate efforts to record and monitor attendance.
Syllabus and Lesson Plan	The syllabus and lesson plan demonstrate that the learning approach

for Package C	is aligned with the equivalency curriculum and includes discussion, practice, and reinforcement of basic literacy activities.
Photos of Learning Activities	Photos show interactive face-to-face activities, with the use of whiteboards, group discussions, and an active, yet simple, classroom atmosphere.

Observations revealed that learning activities took place in modest classrooms with sufficient lighting and ventilation (Table 3). Although lacking advanced media, tutors used whiteboards, printed modules, and simple teaching aids effectively. The classroom atmosphere was participatory, with frequent group discussions and interactive exchanges. Interviews (Table 4) highlighted the use of an andragogical approach, including discussions, case studies, and practice exercises contextualized to participants' daily lives. Flexible scheduling in the afternoons and evenings enabled higher participation among working learners. Tutors provided consistent support, particularly for learners with irregular attendance. Documentation (Table 5) showed a structured schedule (three times weekly), consistent tutor presence, and adherence to the equivalency curriculum. Photos confirmed active participation despite limited facilities.

Learning Effectiveness

Learning effectiveness was evaluated through participant learning outcomes and active participation in class. Observations and documentation showed that participants experienced improvements in their understanding of the material, particularly in basic subjects. The following table presents observation results to demonstrate the effectiveness of C Level Equivalency Program learning.

Table 6. Observation Results of Learning Effectiveness of Package C Program

Focus	Data Findings
Student Engagement	Most participants demonstrated active participation in class. They took notes, asked questions, answered questions, and engaged in discussions as directed by the tutor. Some participants appeared passive at first, but after being given the opportunity to speak or discuss in groups, they became more engaged. The tutor praised and motivated the participants, which resulted in increased engagement.
Learning Evaluation and Follow-up	The tutor regularly provided evaluations in the form of individual assignments, in-class practice problems, and weekly tests. When participants encountered difficulties, the tutor provided further explanations, both individually and in class. Evaluation results were recorded in a daily grade book. Some participants who rarely attended were still facilitated with additional assignments and material review. This demonstrates a learning approach oriented towards the needs and abilities of the participants.
Observed Obstacles	The main obstacle observed was irregular participant attendance, particularly for those who worked full-time or had family responsibilities. This impacted the continuity of learning. The tutor appeared patient in reviewing material for participants who missed

out. Furthermore, limited visual aids meant tutors had to explain things manually repeatedly. Nevertheless, the participants' enthusiasm for learning remained high.

Table 7. Interview Results on Package C Learning Activities

Focus	Data Findings
Improved Academic Understanding	Participants demonstrated improved understanding of the material, particularly in language and mathematics. Tutors noted that participants became more independent in completing assignments and exams.
Evaluation Activities	Evaluations were conducted periodically through quizzes, individual assignments, and practice problems. The goal was to gauge participants' overall understanding and provide feedback for improvement.
Participant Participation	Participant participation increased, indicated by their willingness to engage in discussions, ask questions, and express opinions in class. This demonstrated growing self-confidence and active engagement.
Barriers to Effectiveness	Irregular attendance by participants, especially those working full-time, presented a challenge in maintaining effective learning. Tutors often had to repeat material for students who missed the lesson.
Participant Perceptions of the Learning Process	Participants felt that the learning process helped them understand material that previously felt difficult. The presentation of material related to everyday life made the learning process feel easier and more meaningful.

Table 8. Table of Documentation Results for Package C Learning Activities

Focus	Data Findings
Daily Grade and Exam Recap	The grade documentation shows an increase in student grades from the beginning of the semester to the midterm and final exams. The majority of students achieved scores above the Minimum Competency (KKM).
Learning Follow-up Notes	There are notes on individual guidance for students who are behind or rarely attend. This demonstrates the tutor's response to learning effectiveness.
Evaluation Documentation	The documentation shows quizzes, independent assignments, and practice exams. There is evidence that students receive feedback from tutors through direct correction.
Participant Attendance	Attendance indicates that students who actively attend tend to have better grades, strengthening the relationship between attendance and learning effectiveness.

Findings indicate that the program was effective in facilitating engagement and academic progress. Observations (Table 6) showed that most learners actively participated by asking questions, taking notes, and contributing to discussions. Tutors frequently provided evaluations through assignments, quizzes, and weekly tests, with additional support for learners who missed classes. Challenges included irregular attendance and the absence of advanced teaching media, but tutors compensated with patient explanations and adaptive strategies. Interview results (Table 7) indicated improved understanding in language and mathematics, growing independence in completing tasks, and higher self-confidence in class participation. Documentation (Table 8) confirmed upward trends in grades, systematic evaluation records, and the link between attendance and academic achievement.

Impact of Program Achievements

The C Level Equivalency Program at PKBM Putri Raflesia has been proven to have a real impact on the lives of participants and alumni. These impacts include increased self-confidence, social recognition, access to formal employment, and opportunities to continue their education. This can be seen from the interviews and documentation collected by the researchers.

Table 9. Interview Results: Impact of the Program on Participants' Lives

Focus	Data Findings
Changes in Self-Confidence	After participating in the program, participants felt more confident in communicating and socializing. They no longer felt inferior in work or social settings.
Employment Opportunities and Social Mobility	The program had a direct impact on improving employment access. Many alumni successfully obtained formal employment after earning their Package C diploma.
Continuation of Education	Some alumni continued their education at university or pursued vocational training. The program opened up advanced academic opportunities previously unimaginable for participants.
Economic and Social Impact	Participants and alumni experienced increases in income and social status. A diploma became an important asset for obtaining more stable employment and higher social recognition.
Hopes for the Future	Participants hoped that PKBM would provide additional skills training, such as computer training or entrepreneurship, so that graduates would not only have a diploma but also practical skills.

The data was verified through mutually reinforcing narratives between alumni, tutors, and the institution's head, and supported by documentation of graduate outcomes. The researchers present the following documented data relating to the program's impact on the participants' lives.

Table 10. Documentation Results Relating to the Program’s Impact on Participants’ Lives

Focus	Data Findings
Alumni Data and Graduate History	Data shows that some alumni continue their education at universities (UT, STIT, etc.), while others work in the formal sector, such as shops, village offices, and factories.
Graduation Certificates (SKL)	Alumni use the SKL to apply for jobs and training. Several copies of the SKL were found included in job applications.
Written Alumni Testimonials	Several alumni wrote about their experiences, expressing that the program paved the way for a better life.
Photos of Farewell and Graduation	Activities Photo documentation shows a farewell event that provided symbolic and social awards to participants, boosting self-confidence and recognition.

The program produced significant personal, social, and economic impacts for participants and alumni. Interviews (Table 9) highlighted increased self-confidence, access to employment opportunities, and the continuation of studies at higher education or vocational institutions. Alumni reported higher income and improved social status, and some expressed a desire for additional skills training such as computer literacy or entrepreneurship. Documentation (Table 10) corroborated these findings, showing alumni employed in formal sectors, enrollment in higher education institutions, and the use of graduation certificates for job applications. Testimonials and graduation photos further illustrated enhanced recognition and empowerment among participants.

Discussion

Research findings indicate that the relevance of the C Level Equivalency Program’s objectives extends beyond obtaining a diploma as a bureaucratic requirement, impacting the social, economic, and psychological transformation of participants. Participants report that the program opens access to formal employment opportunities, increases self-esteem, and strengthens their social identity as high school-equivalent graduates. Such outcomes demonstrate that equivalency education is not merely a substitute for formal schooling, but a transformative intervention addressing multidimensional needs of productive-age learners (Sunarti et al., 2022). For instance, recent evidence from Formal Adult Education and Socioeconomic Inequality: Second Chances and Skill Formation demonstrates that adult education including equivalency and further education—helps reduce inequality and improves labor market outcomes for individuals who missed formal schooling (Kosyakova & Bills, 2021). Similarly, (Sunarti et al., 2022) underline the importance of andragogical principles in adult education. By positioning learners as autonomous individuals with prior experiences, tutors can increase engagement and enhance the perceived meaningfulness of program objectives. Flexible methods, dialogue-based sessions, and contextual materials create inclusive and motivating learning environments for C Level participants.

Learning methods and infrastructure are central concerns. (Ayu et al., 2024) shows that adaptive and customized strategies supported by technology help adult learners cope with limited facilities while maximizing learning outcomes. Creative integration of digital tools and learner-centered approaches allows equivalency programs to remain effective even with scarce resources. (Trisnamansyah, 2010) emphasize flexibility, tutor-learner interaction, and relevance of tasks to professional life as key conditions for maintaining motivation. Beyond academic achievement, outcomes also include community empowerment and social recognition. (Junanto et al., 2024) report that PKBM not only provides diplomas but also acts as a space for social inclusion and collective empowerment for productive-age learners. Similarly, (Taryamah, 2022) confirms that equivalency programs function as “second chance” opportunities, enabling school dropouts to redesign life plans, expand employment prospects, and improve self-image.

The learning experiences of C Level participants highlight that while facility constraints and limited infrastructure are real, what matters more is the pedagogical approach, tutor support, and interaction. For example, *Adult Learners’ Perceptions of Distance Education* finds that in distance or non-traditional settings, tutor interaction and responsiveness significantly influence learner satisfaction and outcomes (Akerfeldt et al., 2024). Moreover, flexible schedules and participatory methods are essential for maintaining engagement among working-age adults with multiple responsibilities. As (Right, 2023) reports, many adults cite time constraints (due to work/family) as major barriers, but when programs adapt via flexible delivery modes, participation and outcomes improve. In general, the effectiveness of adult education programs is not determined solely by the availability of facilities, but rather by how well they adapt curriculum, delivery, tutoring to learners’ needs. This corresponds to findings in *How Perception Affects Participation: The Case of Adult Learning and Continuing Vocational Education and Training (CVET)*, where perceived relevance of learning content strongly predicts participation and positive outcomes (Heuer et al., 2025).

D. Conclusions

This study evaluated the relevance, learning experiences, effectiveness, and outcomes of the C Level Equivalency Program at PKBM Putri Raflesia. The findings reveal that the program’s objectives are highly relevant to the needs of productive-age learners, not only in terms of obtaining a high school-equivalent diploma but also in providing opportunities for higher education access and improved employability. Learners reported that their experiences in the program were characterized by flexible schedules, supportive tutors, and peer group discussions, which facilitated both cognitive and social engagement. Despite limited facilities, participants perceived the learning process as effective, especially when practical and experiential approaches were applied. This highlights the centrality of teaching strategies and learner-centered methods over material resources in determining

program success.

The outcomes of the program extend beyond academic achievement, contributing to increased self-confidence, enhanced communication skills, and broader social participation. Furthermore, the program has a significant impact on employability, with participants reporting career advancement and opportunities to pursue higher education. Overall, the study underscores the transformative role of the C Level Equivalency Program in reshaping learners' identities from school dropouts to empowered individuals with renewed educational and social capital. These findings contribute to the theoretical discourse on adult and non-formal education by affirming that educational equivalency programs function not only as credentialing mechanisms but also as agents of personal and social transformation. This study is limited by its focus on a single PKBM in South Bengkulu, which may restrict the generalizability of the findings. The perspectives presented are primarily based on participants who were present and willing to be interviewed, which may exclude the voices of dropouts or less-engaged learners who might have different experiences. Additionally, the cross-sectional design does not capture long-term outcomes or changes over time. Future studies could adopt a longitudinal design to track alumni career trajectories, social mobility, and lifelong learning outcomes after completing the C Level Equivalency Program. Comparative studies across multiple PKBMs with varying levels of resources would also provide a broader perspective on the effectiveness and equity of equivalency programs. Furthermore, integrating quantitative measures alongside qualitative insights could strengthen the robustness of the findings and provide richer evidence for policymakers and practitioners.

E. Acknowledgement

The authors gratefully acknowledge the support of PKBM Putri Raflesia, including its tutors and learners, for their valuable contributions to this study. Appreciation is also extended to colleagues and mentors for their constructive feedback during the research and writing process.

References

- Akerfeldt, A., Bergdahl, N., & Hrastinski, S. (2024). *Adult learners' perceptions of distance education*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14779714231200422>
- Alfauzan, A. A. H., & Tarchouna, N. (2017). The Role of an Aligned Curriculum Design in the Achievement of Learning Outcomes. *Journal of Education and e-Learning Research*, 4(3 SE-Articles), 81-91. <https://doi.org/10.20448/journal.509.2017.43.81.91>
- Arbarini, M., Pathumcaroenwattana, W., Tri, F., & Bagus, S. (2025). *Transforming Communities through Non-Formal Education: A Study of Indonesia and Thailand* (Vol. 2024, Nomor Ijcah 2024). Atlantis Press SARL.

<https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-317-7>

- Ayu, N., Novitasari, D., & Shofwan, I. (2024). *The Effect of Educators ' Pedagogical Competence on the Critical Thinking Ability of Equivalency Education Learners*. 18(1), 36-44.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27-40. <https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Colorafi, Karen Jiggins, & Evans, Bronwynne. (2016). Qualitative Descriptive Methods in Health Science Research. *HERD: Health Environments Research & Design Journal*, 9(4), 16-25. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1937586715614171>
- Hall, Steven, & Liebenberg, Linda. (2024). Qualitative Description as an Introductory Method to Qualitative Research for Master's-Level Students and Research Trainees. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 23, 16094069241242264. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069241242264>
- Harahap, S. S., & Asmawi, M. (2008). *Tyler ' s Goal -Oriented Approach For The Evaluation Of Leadership Training Implementation*. 1326-1334.
- Heuer, A., Serratos-sotelo, L., & Motel-klingsbiel, A. (2025). How perception affects participation : the case of adult learning and continued vocational education and training in Europe. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 44(1), 17-37. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02601370.2024.2398516>
- Ines, G. E. L. (2016). *Classification of learning activities (CLA)*.
- Junanto, S., Tuanaya, R., Shofa, M. F., Muntaha, M., & Permatasari, L. (2024). *Learning evaluation of the study group of Packages C programme in Sragen Regency*. 28(1), 1-14.
- Kallio, H., Pietilä, A.-M., Johnson, M., & Kangasniemi, M. (2016). Systematic methodological review: developing a framework for a qualitative semi-structured interview guide. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 72(12), 2954-2965. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/jan.13031>
- Kosyakova, Y., & Bills, D. B. (2021). *Formal adult education and socioeconomic inequality: Second chances or Matthew Effects? July*, 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12920>
- Melania, M., Kadir, A., Respati, A., & Sachin, P. (2024). *Contribution of Non-Formal Education to Improve the Quality of Human Resources*. 10(1), 169-178.

- Mulhall, A. (2003). In the field: notes on observation in qualitative research. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 41(3), 306–313.
<https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2648.2003.02514.x>
- Neergaard, M. A., Olesen, F., Andersen, R. S., & Sondergaard, J. (2009). Qualitative description – the poor cousin of health research? *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 9(1), 52. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2288-9-52>
- Nowell, Lorelli S, Norris, Jill M, White, Deborah E, & Moules, Nancy J. (2017). Thematic Analysis: Striving to Meet the Trustworthiness Criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16(1), 1609406917733847.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406917733847>
- Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). *Thematic Analysis : Striving to Meet the Trustworthiness Criteria*. 16, 1–13.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406917733847>
- Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Purposeful Sampling for Qualitative Data Collection and Analysis in Mixed Method Implementation Research. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health*, 42(5), 533–544. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y>
- Right, G. S. (2023). *Trends in Adult Learning*.
- Sunarti, V., Iswari, M., Hidayati, A., & Gusmanti, R. (2022). *Analysis of Andragogy Approach in Aspects of Tutor Performance*. 6(2), 200–206.
<https://doi.org/10.23887/bisma.v6i2.51160>
- Taryamah, E. (2022). *Study Of Equivalence Education Program Students ' Soft Skills Level In Preparing To Enter The Competitive Digital Age Job Market*. 5(2), 46–58.
- Trisnamansyah, S. (2010). *Facilitative Learning Model To Improve Learning Creativity In The Equivalent Education Program Package C*. 5(2), 111–119.